

**METRO VANCOUVER REGIONAL DISTRICT
SOLID WASTE AND RECYCLING INDUSTRY ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MEETING #5**

Minutes of the Solid Waste and Recycling Industry Advisory Committee Meeting #5 held at 1:00 p.m. on Tuesday, September 7, 2022, at the Metro Vancouver Head Office, Room 2912, 4515 Central Boulevard, Burnaby BC and via Zoom.

MEMBERS PRESENT IN-PERSON:

Craig Hodge, Director, Metro Vancouver
Board of Directors (Co-Chair)

Mary Polak, Waste Connections of Canada
(Co-Chair)

Izzie Abrams, Waste Connections of Canada
Ken Carrusca, Cement Association of Canada
Mannie Cheung, Product Care Assoc. of BC

Jamie Kaminski, HSR Zero Waste
Achilles Mallari, Sierra Waste Services Ltd.
Ralph McRae, Revolution
David Millman, Waste Management
Association of Canada
Cynthia Shore, Republic Services

MEMBERS PRESENT ON ZOOM:

Lori Bryan, Waste Management Assoc. of BC
James Collins, Tymac Launch Service Ltd.
Christian Dietrich, Ecowaste Industries
Robby Gill, Cloverdale Fuel Ltd.
Grant Hankins, Waste Management
Association of BC
Gord Johnson, Empower
Environmental/Northstar
Aiden Kiani, Lock-Block Ltd.
Jacqueline Lotzkar, Pacific Metals Recycling
Inc.

Matthew McAra, GFL
Maya Moucachen, Merlin Plastics
Terryl Plotnikoff, Canadian Mattress
Recycling Inc.
Shad Prasad, Cascade Recovery+
Liliana Segal, Green Chair Recycling
Nicole Stefenelli, Urban Impact Recycling
Sebastian van Wollen, Blue Planet Recycling
Michael Zarbl, Major Appliances Recycling
Roundtable
Sean Kawakami, Convertus Group

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Binder Boora, BC Earth Exchange
Jeremy Crawford, Waste Control Services
Kenneth Ingram, West Coast Reduction Ltd.
Nicole Peers, Queensborough Landing Recycling Depot
Josh Van Doorn, Super Save Disposal

METRO VANCOUVER STAFF:

Brooke Atkinson, Communications and Education Coordinator, Strategy and Stakeholder
Relations, Solid Waste Services
Sarah Evanetz, Division Manager, Strategy and Stakeholder Relations, Solid Waste Services
Terry Fulton, Senior Project Engineer, Solid Waste Services Planning, Zero Waste Implementation
Paul Henderson, General Manager, Solid Waste Services
Alison Hilkewich, Assistant to the General Manager, Solid Waste Services
Karen Storry, Senior Engineer, Planning and Zero Waste Implementation, Solid Waste Services
Lynne Vidler, Lead Senior Engineer, Operations and Planning, Solid Waste Services

Sandy Young, Senior Engagement Specialist, Strategy and Stakeholder Relations,
Solid Waste Services

Zeenia Mizan, Communications Officer, Strategy and Stakeholder Relations,
Solid Waste Services

Chris Underwood, Division Manager, Solid Waste Planning, Solid Waste Services

Chris Allan, Director, Solid Waste Operations, Solid Waste Services

CITY OF VANCOUVER STAFF:

Lynn Belanger, Manager, Transfer and Landfill Operations Branch

FACILITATION:

Andrea Manchon, Facilitator, Argyle Communications

Christie Libby, Facilitator, Argyle Communications

Krystyna Lloyd, Facilitator, Argyle Communications

Sarah Bradley, Facilitator, Argyle Communications

Beatrice Batigne, Notetaker, Argyle Communications

Patricia Almeida, Notetaker, Argyle Communications

Taruni Singh, Notetaker, Argyle Communications

PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Rae Ratslef, Raincoast Ventures Ltd.

Agenda

1. Agenda
 - 1.1. September 7, 2022 Meeting Agenda
 - 1.2. Workshop Format Overview
2. Minutes
 - 2.1. June 7, 2022 Meeting Minutes
3. Topic Presentations
 - 3.1. Metro Vancouver Disposal Ban Program
 - 3.2. Waste Reduction and Recycling Data
 - 3.3. Zero Waste and Circular Economy
 - 3.4. Residential and Commercial/Institutional Residual Garbage Management
 - 3.5. Questions/Comments
4. Topic Discussion Group Sessions
 - 4.1 Topic Discussion Group Session 1
 - 4.2 Topic Discussion Group Session 2
 - 4.3 Workshop Debrief
5. Next Steps
 - 5.1. IAC Members Registration for September 28-29, 2022 Zero Waste Conference
 - 5.2. October 4th and November 1st Meeting Format

MEETING MINUTES

Craig Hodge, Co-Chair, called the meeting to order at 1:03 p.m., welcomed attendees to the Solid Waste Industry and Recycling Advisory Committee (IAC) meeting, and acknowledged the traditional territories of the Indigenous Nations whose territories are in the Metro Vancouver region. It was noted that there would also be a virtual component of the plenary portions of this meeting.

1. AGENDA

1.1 September 7, 2022 Meeting Agenda

Co-Chair Hodge called for additions or changes to the agenda. No additions or changes were identified.

2. MINUTES

2.1 June 7, 2022 Meeting Minutes

Co-Chair Hodge indicated a team from Argyle Communications was present to facilitate and take notes during the topic discussion groups.

Co-Chair Hodge led IAC members attending in person and virtually, in a round of self-introductions.

Co-Chair Hodge called for errors or omissions in the minutes of the June 7, 2022 IAC meeting. No errors or omissions were identified.

3. TOPIC PRESENTATIONS

Andrea Manchon, Argyle Communications, Facilitator, noted there would be four presentations provided by Metro Vancouver on key topics that were previously chosen by IAC members, following which there would be a questions/comments session and discussion groups.

The IAC Terms of Reference were referenced, and an overview of the IAC Code of Conduct was provided.

3.1 Metro Vancouver Disposal Ban Program

Lynne Vidler, Lead Senior Engineer, Operations and Planning, Solid Waste Services, provided a presentation titled “Metro Vancouver Disposal Ban Program”, and highlighted:

- Regional solid waste facilities
 - There are seven recycling and waste centres (including Central Surrey opening September 9 and Vancouver South Transfer Station), one waste-to-energy facility, and the Vancouver Landfill
 - There are nine inspectors that rotate among the facilities

- Metro Vancouver reports out on the program annually to the Zero Waste Committee. Most recurring surcharged materials consist of mattresses, oversized items, and gypsum, cardboard and electronics.

- Customer may dispute any surcharges by submitting a surcharge dispute form available online
- In 2021, there were just over 3,000 surcharges issued, and 15 dispute forms were received
- 2021 data for Disposal Ban Program performance for customer type, loads inspected, surcharge notices issued, and surcharge rate for non-account, municipal, and commercial

3.2 Waste Reduction and Recycling Data

Terry Fulton, Senior Project Engineer, Planning and Zero Waste Implementation, Solid Waste Services, provided a presentation titled “Waste Reduction and Recycling Data”, and highlighted:

- Types and quantities of waste generated (disposal + recycling, composition of material disposed, tonnage of commodities recycled)
 - Source of material – residential, commercial, and small loads
- Metro Vancouver tracks progress on various initiatives
 - Goals: Gauge progress and identify targets for future programs and policies
 - Tracks disposal quantities, source, and scale data
 - Disposal data sources: municipal surveys, scale data, waste composition studies, and private facilities
 - Recycling data sources: licensed and unlicensed private facilities and Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR) reports
 - Reuse data sources: reuse and repair organizations, scale data, and calculations
- Generation and recycling over time
 - Interest is to see the disposal and generation lines decreasing
- Recycling rates
 - 2020 data – 64% recycling and diverted, 36 % landfill and waste to energy
 - Recycling rate by sector - residential - single-family 64% and multi-family 38%, commercial/industrial 44%, and 78% construction/demolition
- 2011 Solid Waste Management Plan targets
 - 10% reduction waste generation (achieved 11%)
 - 80% recycling rate (achieved 64%)

3.3 Zero Waste and Circular Economy

Karen Storry, Senior Engineer, Planning and Zero Waste Implementation, Solid Waste Services, provided a presentation titled “Zero Waste and Circular Economy”, and highlighted:

- Examples of tools used to transition to a circular economy (informed by the latest data and research), including collaboration, research, policy, programs, infrastructure, and public education
- Three principles of the circular economy
 - Design out waste and pollution
 - Regenerate natural systems
 - Keep products and materials in use

- Textiles campaigns in the Metro Vancouver region
 - Year 1 – The Life Cycle of Unwanted Clothing
 - Year 2 – We Each Trash 44 T-Shirts Per Year
 - Year 3 – Think Thrice About Your Clothes – Reduce, Repair, Reuse
- Construction and Demolition (C&D) Waste Reduction and Recycling Toolkit – (October 2020)
 - In 2020, the Toolkit was updated to include more options beyond recycling, i.e., adaptive reuse, house moving, deconstruction, and salvage and reuse
- Examples of collaboration
 - Recycling Council of British Columbia (RCBC) Recycling Database; Metro Vancouver Recycles helps residents find recycling options; data is powered by RCBC
 - Reuse Day at the North Shore Recycling and Waste Centre – June 2019 diverted 1,565 kg of reusable materials; end of August 2022 collected over 2,000 kg in four hours
- National Zero Waste Council
 - Focus areas: waste prevention, circular economy, C&D, food, plastics, and product design and packaging
 - Recently launched its circular cities and regions initiative.
- Circular economies value material regeneration through reuse and recycling over resource extraction by eliminating waste which requires community-based collaborations, research, policy programs, infrastructure and education
- Examples included:
 - Textile Waste: Much infrastructure for sorting clothing exists in Metro Vancouver; everything can be donated and 25% of collected clothing is resold locally
 - Construction and Demolition Waste: Potential toolkits for municipalities and private companies to reduce waste and explore adaptive reuse, deconstruction etc.
 - Networking: Metro Vancouver created the Regional Food Recovery Network and National Zero Waste Council to focus on waste prevention and creation of circular economies

3.4 Residential and Commercial/Institutional Residual Garbage Management

Paul Henderson, General Manager, Solid Waste Services, provided a presentation titled “Residential and Commercial/Institutional Residual Garbage Management”, and highlighted:

- Tipping Fee Bylaw includes the Generator Levy, which is applicable to all residential and commercial/institutional garbage
- Generator Levy
 - Encourages delivery of garbage to Metro Vancouver and City of Vancouver facilities and simplifies tracking diversion goal progress

- Loads are subject to tipping fee bylaw requirements
- Effective January 1, 2018
- \$54/tonne in 2022
- Hauler remits to Metro Vancouver if they deliver residential or commercial/institutional garbage to other facilities
- Generator Levy history
 - *GVS&DD Act* amended in 1995 to provide authority to implement the Generator Levy
 - Tipping Fee Bylaw amended by GVS&DD Tipping Fee and Solid Waste Disposal Regulation Amending Bylaw No. 308, 2017 to include the Generator Levy
 - February 2018 update to ensure the Generator Levy was only paid once for facilities recovering energy or materials

3.5 Questions/Comments

IAC members were invited to participate in discussion on the presentations, which prompted the following questions/comments and *responses*:

- Suggestion that construction and demolition recycling rates are lower than reported due to inclusion of concrete in calculation:
 - *Metro Vancouver's approach provides a transparent data set that details the numbers and specific materials. We have heard the comment regarding concrete previously.*
- Suggestion that data from product stewards may not be reliable, question as to whether data excludes materials collected but not recycled?
 - *Product Stewards are obligated to report on success of collection and recycling of materials within their category. For example, RecycleBC reports out on total materials collected as well as end fate of materials.*
 - *Metro Vancouver reports based on actually recycled materials rather than simply inbound. Metro Vancouver does count as recycling materials used as fuel to offset fossil fuels, but materials managed at the Waste-to-Energy Facility are not counted as recycling.*
- A member commented that 96% of concrete is recycled, but that is generally to a lower use. Industry is working on this to make it more of a circular economy and using it to make more concrete. Concrete and wood waste is the reason that C&D recycling rate (78%) is very high. We need to be transparent and show the figures.
- Are lithium batteries banned materials under the tipping fee bylaw? These batteries create a substantial fire hazard when management incorrectly.
 - *Lithium batteries are among the banned materials at Metro Vancouver Solid Waste Facilities, but are not commonly seen in the waste stream.*
- 11% reduction in the generation of waste. What activities contributed to that?
 - *A variety of factors likely resulted in the observed decline in waste generation.*

It is difficult to determine a specific cause or causes. It is easier to see how disposal is decreasing and recycling is increasing due to specific actions such as organics recycling. The cause or causes of reductions in generation are more difficult to conclusively determine.

- Do you focus on the residual number vs. the recyclable number? That would help improve the recycling numbers. When you send something to recycling do you know the residual number? We need a more realistic recyclable number.
 - *The material data provided depends on the source of the data. The Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR) stewards' annual reports show incoming materials and their end fate so good data is available, however it is not the same for all materials.*
- Regarding the data collection and comment about the 80% aspiration goal of recycling and diversion, that number was picked approximately 15 years ago. Is it still being used? Has a business/data collection model been played out to reach that 80% and what does that mean for the folks in the room from a collection standpoint and for taxpayers that need to pay for it?
 - *The 80% diversion target in the current solid waste management plan was selected without a significant amount of technical analysis. As part of developing the new solid waste management plan, it will be key action in developing a new solid waste management plan will be to establish new targets for waste reduction along with developing new targets for parameters such as greenhouse gas emission reduction. We would like to do that in a fact-based approach.*
- A member commented that the public is ready for new/achievable targets.

It was noted that questions/comments could also be submitted by email to solidwasteoperations@metrovancover.org by Thursday, September 8, 2022 for inclusion in the meeting notes.

4. TOPIC DISCUSSION GROUP SESSIONS

The Facilitator noted that those attending the meeting in person would have an opportunity to participate in two of the four discussion groups, and that the plenary session would resume at 3:30 p.m.

Discussion group notes are attached as Appendix 1

5 NEXT STEPS

5.1 IAC Members Registration for September 28-29, 2022 Zero Waste Conference

Brooke Atkinson, Communications and Education Coordinator, Metro Vancouver, indicated the presentations are available on the IAC meeting site under today's meeting. An invitation was extended to all IAC members to register for the September 28-29, 2022 Zero Waste Conference, noting that Metro Vancouver would cover the related costs.

5.2 October 4th and November 1st Meeting Format

Brooke Atkinson thanked IAC members for their participation and advised that the next meetings were scheduled to occur on October 4, 2022 and November 1, 2022.

It was noted that there was a change to a members Statement of Interest Declaration and that could be found on the IAC website.

Paul Henderson indicated there would be a post-workshop survey in the next several days on the process of the workshop, to assist in planning for future additional workshops.

Co-Chair Hodge thanked members for their participation, the presenters, the facilitation and note-taking team, and Co-Chair Polak.

5. CONCLUSION

The Solid Waste and Recycling Industry Advisory Committee meeting concluded at 3:51 p.m.

55432942

Appendix 1:

<p align="center">Metro Vancouver Solid Waste and Recycling Industry Advisory Committee September 7, 2022 Topic Discussion Group Notes</p>		
<p>4.1 Metro Vancouver Disposal Ban Program – Session 1</p>	<p>Argyle Facilitator: Christie Libby Metro Vancouver staff: Lynne Vidler</p>	<p>Question 1: What improvements could be made to the disposal ban program?</p> <p>IAC members identified a need for more information on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - New initiatives for the disposal ban program <p>IAC members would like Metro Vancouver to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Review the disposal ban effectiveness matrix from the previous disposal ban effectiveness working group - Provide data to haulers about areas/industries where there is incorrect recycling - Lower the organics ban from 25 % to 5 % - Create an improved feedback loop between Metro Vancouver, the waste generator and the hauler so Metro Vancouver can better understand the resources haulers require in order to implement this policy - Look at the motivations of the waste generator to design persuasive messaging to change their behaviors - Address the issue that it's cheaper for waste processors to mix garbage and organics, instead of separating waste streams - The generator who recycles incorrectly should be the one who takes responsibility and is fined <p>IAC members had questions about:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Whether Metro Vancouver can support haulers with resources to fine waste generators who recycle incorrectly - The possibility of fast tracking for clean loads (e.g. how to encourage clear bags for inspectors to see, how to sample bags safely) - How inspectors gauge whether 20-25% of a load is organics

<p>4.1.1 Metro Vancouver Disposal Ban Program – Session 2</p>	<p>Argyle Facilitator: Christie Libby Metro Vancouver staff: Lynne Vidler</p>	<p>Question 1: What improvements could be made to the disposal ban program?</p> <p>IAC members identified a need for more information on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Rates of illegal dumping in Metro Vancouver - Inspectors basing fines arbitrarily on either weight or volume - Why the inspection system fines the hauler when the waste generator (consumer) recycles incorrectly - The effectiveness of fines leading to changes in recycling rates <p>IAC members would like Metro Vancouver to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Conduct additional assessment of the impact of organic surcharges (e.g., 5%, 10%, 15%, 20%) - Implement a front-end system to collect a deposit from consumers at the point of sale to fund drywall disposal programs - Bylaw enforcement officers inspecting garbage at homes and job sites in addition to waste processing facilities <p>IAC members had questions about:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The visual inspection system when haulers take waste to processing facilities - If fines for organics and mattress disposal bans lead to changes in recycling rates <p>Question 2: What other programs/initiatives could be used in addition to, or instead of, the disposal ban program?</p> <p>IAC members suggested the following for consideration:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Extended producer responsibility programs - Additional surcharges for organics or books which are difficult to properly dispose of (binding removal is a challenge) - Tracking (“shadowing”) inspectors to find efficiencies or improvements in their processes - Hiring additional inspectors to physically examine loads
<p>4.2 Waste Reduction and Recycling Data – Session 1</p>	<p>Argyle facilitator: Krystyna Lloyd Metro Vancouver staff: Terry Fulton</p>	<p>Question 1: What improvements could be made to Metro Vancouver’s waste and recycling data collection, analysis and reporting processes?</p> <p>IAC members would like Metro Vancouver to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provide information on disposal, recycling and residual rates which connects to how data is recorded

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provide a clear definition and description of what is and what is not included in the calculation <p>Question 2: What additional information/analysis would be useful?</p> <p>IAC members would like Metro Vancouver to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provide a clear definition and description of what is and what is not included in the calculation <p>Question 3: What information is available in other communities that could be helpful in Metro Vancouver?</p> <p>IAC members noted that comparisons between communities are challenging because of differences in data collection methods as well as differences in local circumstances.</p>
<p>4.2.1 Waste Reduction and Recycling Data – Session 2</p>	<p>Argyle facilitator: Krystyna Lloyd Metro Vancouver staff: Terry Fulton</p>	<p>Question 1: What improvements could be made to Metro Vancouver’s waste and recycling data collection, analysis and reporting processes?</p> <p>IAC members would like Metro Vancouver to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Audit/authenticate recycling rate information - Only reporting on what’s under Metro Vancouver’s direct control (i.e. garbage only) <p>IAC members identified a need for more information on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - What percentage of waste is burned - What percentage of waste is actually recyclable - Rates of foreign vs. domestic recycling <p>Question 2: What additional information/analysis would be useful?</p> <p>IAC members would like Metro Vancouver to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Improve the reporting structure of collection methods to achieve the goals of Metro Vancouver policies Communicating with the rest of the industry if a waste recycler doesn’t make proper reports - To not include concrete recycling as part of the overall recycling rates <p>Question 3: What information is available in other communities that could be helpful in Metro Vancouver?</p> <p>IAC members identified a need for more information on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Requirements to verify the recycling rates that facilities produce. Alternatively, if facilities can’t produce a recycling rate, or undergo auditing, they should receive a zero recycling rate

<p>4.3.1 Zero Waste and Circular Economy – Session 2</p>	<p>Argyle facilitator: Sarah Bradley Metro Vancouver staff: Karen Storry</p>	<p>Question 1: What are some of the opportunities for growing the circular economy in our region? IAC members would like Metro Vancouver to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Include major manufacturers (i.e. the producers of single-use items) in conversations about the circular economy - Promote the benefits of circular goods, there needs to be a clear value proposition for all participants in the supply chain for circular goods to gain a foothold in the economy - Challenge is how easy it is for companies to greenwash their products by claiming that they contribute to the circular economy - Reinforce their values by taking action to relax zoning or provide grants and incentives for businesses participating in the circular economy - Provide the environment for end-use products to be reconfigured into new products - Could do a better job of promoting the fact that concrete is recycled for non- structural uses to the public - Metro Vancouver’s efforts to consolidate recycling resources was helpful in providing clear and consistent information to the public <p>IAC members identified a need for more information on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The challenges to create a 100% circular economy because there needs to be demand and a clear business case for products that have been reused, repurposed or repaired - So many products being manufactured offshore, it is not practical for all products to end up in the circular economy stream <p>Question 2: Thinking about procurement, what are the opportunities in municipal/regional/private sector procurement processes? IAC members would like Metro Vancouver to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Have procurement documents with clear policies about using recycled content, however, this must be reinforced with an enforcement mechanism
<p>4.4 Residual Garbage</p>	<p>Argyle facilitator:</p>	<p>Question 1: What are the best practices in advancing waste diversion and waste management services?</p>

<p>Management – Session 1</p>	<p>Andrea Manchon Metro Vancouver staff: Paul Henderson</p>	<p>IAC members identified a need for more information on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - City of Seattle was identified as a community with successful waste diversion practices. <p>Question 2: What opportunities do you see with generator levy implementation?</p> <p>IAC members had questions about:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No levy payments have been remitted to Metro Vancouver and questioned if this meant no waste is being delivered to facilities other than Metro Vancouver’s. Metro Vancouver doesn’t have any information that would suggest residential and commercial/institutional garbage is being delivered to facilities other than City of Vancouver and Metro Vancouver solid waste facilities. - The challenges with the generator levy in terms of the different sources to rely on for data. Regulated businesses are required to make reports, but it will be harder to collect voluntary data or getting data from entities outside of Metro Vancouver. - Concern was expressed that Metro Vancouver both regulates and operates solid waste facilities. <p>Question 3: What roles should the private/public sector play in the delivery of waste and recycling services?</p> <p>IAC members would like Metro Vancouver to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Establish a clear delineation of policy-making, regulatory and service delivery roles, as well as a mandate to find the best use for taxpayers’ money for both sectors.
-----------------------------------	---	---